BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03328 4803

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

CIVIL APPEALS & JUDICIAL REVIEW

Analysis, Process and Strategy in Civil Proceedings

Case
Volume I (A)

JOHN A. CAMPION
PAUL F. MONAHAN
FASKEN CAMPBELL GODFREY
Toronto, Ontario
(416) 366-8381

DIANA DIMMER
CITY OF TORONTO LEGAL DEPARTMENT

Spring 1996

Prepared with the Assistance of
Sonya Maestre, Scott Wallace
and Andrew Burns

Awv - 3795
BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
JAN 10 1986
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

CIVIL APPEALS & JUDICIAL REVIEW

Analysis, Process and Strategy in Civil Proceedings

Case
Volume I (A)

JOHN A. CAMPION
PAUL F. MONAHAN
FASKEN CAMPBELL GODFREY
Toronto, Ontario
(416) 366-8381

DIANA DIMMER
CITY OF TORONTO LEGAL DEPARTMENT

Spring 1996

Prepared with the Assistance of
Sonya Maestre, Scott Wallace
and Andrew Burns

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/civilappealsjudi01camp

CIVIL APPEALS AND JUDICIAL REVIEW

TABLE OF CONTENTS - VOLUME I

INTRODUCTION

PART I - APPELLATE POWERS AND PROCEDURE

CHAPTER 1 - Final and Interlocutory Orders

A. Merritt, "Final and Interlocutory Orders: An Analysis of the Present Law in Ontario" (1983), 4 *Advocates Quarterly* 484-499. 1

Bozson v. Altrincham Urban District Council, [1903] 1 K.B. 547 (C.A.). 17

Hendrickson v. Kallio, [1932] O.R. 675, [1932] 4 D.L.R. 580 (C.A.). 20

Ontario Medical Association v. Miller (1976), 14 O.R. (2d) 468, 2 C.P.C. 125 (C.A.). 26

Delaney Boat Lines and Services Ltd. et al. v. City of Barrie (1976), 15 O.R. (2d) 675 (C.A.). 29

MacKay v. Queen Elizabeth Hospital (1989), 68 O.R. (2d) 92, 40 C.P.C. (2d) 307 (H.C.J.). 31

Buck Bros. Ltd. v. Frontenac Builders Ltd. (1994), 19 O.R. (3d) 97, 117 D.L.R. (4th) 373 (C.A.). 36

CHAPTER 2 - Stay of Order Pending Appeal

Talsky v. Talsky (No. 2) (1973), 1 O.R. (2d) 148 (C.A.). 45

International Corona Resources Ltd. v. Lac Minerals Ltd. (1986), 21 C.P.C. (2d) 252 (Ont. C.A.). 54

International Corona Resources Ltd. v. Lac Minerals Ltd. (1987), 21 C.P.C. (2d) 256 (Ont. C.A.). 59

Re Rocket et al. and Royal College of Dental Surgeons of Ontario (1989), 66 O.R. (2d) 73, (1988), 64 O.R. (2d) 353 aff'd in [1990] 2 S.C.R. 232. 63

820099 Ontario Inc. v. Harold E. Ballard Ltd. (1991), 49 C.P.C. (2d) 239 (Div. Ct.). 70

CHAPTER 3 - Question of Law; Question of Fact; Mixed Law and Fact

Tisdale (Township) v. Hollinger Consol. Gold Mines Ltd., [1933] S.C.R. 321 (S.C.C.). 76

CNR v. Bell Telephone, [1939] S.C.R. 308 (S.C.C.). 85

Re Can. Metal Co. and Heap (1975), 54 D.L.R. (3d) 641 (C.A.). 98

Re Schiller and Board of Governors of Scarborough General Hospital (1975), 9 O.R. (2d) 648 (C.A.). 108

Re Ebsco Investments Ltd. and Ebsco Subscription Services Ltd. (1975), 11 O.R. (2d) 305 (C.A.). 113

Wade v. Canadian National Railway Co. (1977), 80 D.L.R. (3d) 214 (S.C.C.). 115

CHAPTER 4 - Scope of Review

R.D. Gibbens "Appellate Review of Findings of Fact", (1992), 13 *Advocates Quarterly*, pp. 445-452. 135

Re Beardmore, [1935] O.R. 526 (C.A.). 143

Industrial Tanning Co. v. Reliable Leather Sportwear Ltd., [1953] 4 D.L.R. 522 (C.A.), [1953] O.W.N. 921; affirmed [1955] 2 D.L.R. 284 (S.C.C.). 153

Re Barath and Bacsek (1975), 11 O.R. (2d) 531, 66 D.L.R. (3d) 595 (Div. Ct.). 159

Métivier v. Cadorette, [1977] 1 S.C.R. 371 (S.C.C.). 167

Lewis v. Todd et al. (1980), 115 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.). 181

Schreiber Brothers Ltd. v. Currie Products Ltd. et al., [1980] 2 S.C.R. 78, (1980), 108 D.L.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.). 199

Beaudoin-Daigneault v. Richard, [1984] 1 S.C.R. 2 (S.C.C.). 207

Seven Limers Coal & Fertilizer Co. Inc. v. Hewitt et al. (1985), 52 O.R. (2d) 1 (C.A.). 224

Re Ledyit and Alford (1985), 53 O.R. (2d) 311 (Dist. Ct.). 234

Century Ins. Co. of Can. v. N.V. Bocimar S.A. (1987), 17 C.P.C. (2d) 204, [1987] 1 S.C.R. 1247 (S.C.C.). 240

Lensen v. Lensen, (1987), 23 C.P.C. (2d) 33, [1987] 2 S.C.R. 672 (S.C.C.). 245

Lapointe v. Hospital LeGardeur, [1992] 1 S.C.R. 351 (S.C.C.). 258

M. Anne Chaplin, "Who is best suited to decide? The Recent Trend in Standards of Judicial Review" (1994), Vol. 26:2, *Ottawa Law Review*, 321 at pp. 350-355. 292

CHAPTER 5 - Scope of Review of a Discretionary Order

Re Harju and City of Thunder Bay et al. (1975), 8 O.R. 633, 58 D.L.R. (3d) 689 (C.A.). 298

Marleen Investments Ltd. v. McBride (1979), 23 O.R. (2d) 125, 13 C.P.C. 221 (H.C.J.). 306

Stoicevski v. Casement (1983), 43 O.R. (2d) 436, 43 C.P.C. 178 (C.A.). 310

Picotte Insulation Inc. v. Mansonville Plastics (B.C.) Ltd. (1985), 48 C.P.C. 169 (Ont. H.C.J.). 320

Tru-Style Designs Inc. v. Greymac Properties Inc. (1986), 56 O.R. (2d) 462, 11 C.P.C. (2d) 117 (H.C.J.). 324

Baddeley v. Baddeley (1989), 65 D.L.R. (4th) 130, 71 O.R. (2d) 318 (H.C.J.). 343

Westminer Canada Holdings Ltd. v. Coughlan (1990), 75 O.R. (2d) 73 D.L.R. (4th) 584 (Div. Ct.). 351

Borden & Elliot v. Deer Home Investments Ltd. (1992), 14 C.P.C. (3d) 269 (Ont. Gen. Div.). 364

CHAPTER 6 - Setting Aside Jury Verdicts

Vertulia v. Kratz, [1956] O.R. 884, 6 D.L.R. (2d) 8 (C.A.). 384

McNichol v. Ardiel (1978), 22 O.R. (2d) 324, 93 D.L.R. (3d) 335 (C.A.). 400

Graham v. Hodgkinson (1983), 40 O.R. (2d) 697 (C.A.), leave to appeal to Supreme Court of Canada refused 51 N.R. 398. 408

Farrugia v. Springer (1992), 9 C.P.C. (3d) 55 (Ont. C.A.). 419

Anderson v. Maple Ridge (District) (1992), 10 C.P.C. (3d) 258 (B.C.C.A.), leave to appeal to Supreme Court of Canada refused (1993), 74 B.C.L.R. (2d) xxx (note). 423

CHAPTER 7 - Raising New Evidence and Issues on Appeal

New Evidence

Becker Milk Co. v. Consumers Gas Co. (1974), 2 O.R. (2d) 554, 43 D.L.R. (3d) 498 (C.A.). 436

Mercer v. Sijan (1976), 1 C.P.C. 281, 14 O.R. (2d) 12 (C.A.). 442

Cook v. Mounce (1979), 26 O.R. (2d) 129, 12 C.P.C. 5 (Div. Ct.). 449

Sengmueller v. Sengmueller (1994), 17 O.R. (3d) 208, 25 C.P.C. (3d) 61 (C.A.). 452

New Issues

Shaver Hospital for Chest Diseases v. Slesar (1980), 27 O.R. (2d) 383n, 106 D.L.R. (3d) 377n (referring for further consideration C.A., Ontario, (1979), 27 O.R. (2d) 383, 15 C.P.C. 97.) (C.A.). 463

CHAPTER 8 - Conduct of the Trial Judge

Chambers v. Murphy, [1953] 2 D.L.R. 705, [1953] O.W.N. 399 (C.A.). 471

Phillips v. Ford Motor Co. of Canada Ltd., [1971] 2 O.R. 637, 18 D.L.R. (3d) 641 (C.A.). 473

J.M.W. Recycling Inc. v. Attorney-General of Canada (1982), 35 O.R. (2d) 355, 133 D.L.R. (3d) 363 (C.A.). 500

Triple A. Investments Ltd. v. Adams Bros. Ltd. (1985), 56 Nfld. & P.E.I.R. 272 (Nfld. C.A.). 510

CHAPTER 9 - Costs and Awards - Reviewing Assessment of Damages

Rawson v. Kasman, [1956] O.W.N. 359 (C.A.). 517

Mulroy v. Aqua Scene (1982), 36 O.R. (2d) 653 (C.A.). 521

Shell Canada Resources Ltd. v. Sayers (1985), 41 Alta L.R. (2d) 197 (C.A.), leave to appeal to Supreme Court of Canada refused (1986), 41 Alta. L.R. (2d) liv. 527

Walker v. CFTO Ltd. (1987), 59 O.R. (2d) 104, 37 D.L.R. (4th) 224 (C.A.). 530

PART II - JUDICIAL REVIEW

INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER 1 - Jurisdiction

Judicial Review, *Ontario Manual of Civil Litigation*, (Carswell, 1994) pp. 2-135 - 2-126 549

Administrative v. Judicial or Quasi-Judicial Decisions

Re Robertson et al. and Niagara South Board of Education (1973), 1 O.R. (2d) 548 (Div. Ct.). 576

Aylward v. McMaster University (1991), 47 Admin. L.R. 198 (Gen. Div.). 585

Administrative Decision Violating a Statute

Re Metropolitan Board of Commissioners of Police and Ontario Municipal Employees' Retirement Board (1985), 53 O.R. 83 (Div. Ct.); reversed 32 O.A.C. 322 (C.A.). 597

Decision of Organizations Not Established by Special Statute

Pestell et al. v. Kitchener-Waterloo Real Estate Board Inc. et al. (1981), 34 O.R. 476 (Div. Ct.). 609

Re Rees and United Association of Journeymen and Apprentices of the Plumbing and Pipefitting Industry of the United States and Canada, Local 527 (1983), 43 O.R. (2d) 97 (Div. Ct.). 614

Consensual or Non-Statutory Tribunal

Re University of Guelph and Cdn. Ass'n of University Teachers (1980), 29 O.R. (2d) 312 (H.C.J.). 626

Constitutional Validity versus Exercise of Statutory Power

Re Service Employees International Union, Local 204 and Broadway Manor Nursing Home et al. (1984), 48 O.R. (2d) 225 (C.A.). 641

Exhaustion of Alternative Remedies

Brode, P. "When it is Premature to Apply for Judicial Review?" case comment (1993), *Advocates Quarterly*, Vol. 15, p. 352. 666

Re Woodglen and Co. Ltd. and City of North York et al. (1983), 42 O.R. 385 (Div. Ct.). 670

Re Gage and Attorney-General for Ontario (1992), 90 D.L.R. (4th) 537 (Div. Ct.). 673

Ressel v. Board of Directors of Chiropractic (1990), 41 O.A.C. 321 (Div. Ct.). 691

CHAPTER 2 - Parties and Standing

Rosenberg et al. v. Grand River Conservation Authority et al. (1976), 12 O.R. 497 (C.A.). 693

Noddle v. City of Toronto et al. (1982), 37 O.R. (2d) 421 (H.C.J.). 710

CHAPTER 3 - Evidence

Re Keeprite Workers' Independent Union et al. and Keeprite Products Ltd. (1980), 29 O.R. (2d) 513 (C.A.). 716

Re Ontario Public Service Employees Union et al. and The Queen in Right of Ontario (1984), 45 O.R. (2d) 70 (H.C.J.). 726

Securicor Investigations & Security Ltd. v. Ontario Labour Relations Board (1985), 10 Admin. L.R. 189 (Div. Ct.). 735

Colautti Construction Ltd. v. Inter'l Union of Operating Engineers et al. (1986), 18 O.A.C. 62 (C.A.). 742

Dionne v. Sawyer (1990), 106 N.B.R. (2d) 25 (N.B.C.A.). 758

CHAPTER 4 - Remedial Power

Re Nicholson and Haldimand-Norfolk Regional Board of Commissioners of Police (1980), 31 O.R. (2d) 195 (C.A.). 763

Slavutych v. Baker et al. (1975), 55 D.L.R. (3d) 224 (S.C.C.). 773

CHAPTER 5 - Due Process

Mullan, David J. "Natural Justice - The Challenges of *Nicholson*, Deference Theory & The Charter" in Neil R. Finkelstein and Brian MacLeod Rogers eds., *Recent Developments in Administrative Law*, Toronto: Carswell, 1987, pp. 1-52. 783

Re Vance and Hardit Corp. et al. (1985), 53 O.R. (2d) 183 (Div. Ct.). 835

Re 36479 Ontario Ltd. and Gravelle et al. (1986), 53 O.R. (2d) 719 (Div. Ct.). 842

Re Collins et al. and Pension Commission of Ontario et al. (1986), 56 O.R. (2d) 274 (Div. Ct.). 848

Re Miramichi Agricultural Exhibition Assoc. Ltd. v. N.B. (Lotteries Commissioner) (1995), 126 D.L.R. (4th) 557 (N.B.C.A.). 872

Re Consolidated-Bathurst Packaging Ltd. and International Woodworkers of America, Local 2-69 et al. (1985), 51 O.R. (2d) 481 (S.C.C.). 883

Re Ladney et al. and Township of Moore (1984), 46 O.R. (2d) 586 (Div. Ct.). 940

CHAPTER 6 - Non-Procedural Review: Jurisdiction & Discretion

Re Metropolitan General Hospital and Minister of Health (1979), 25 O.R. (2d) 699 (H.C.J.). 945

Re Apotex Inc. and Attorney-General for Ontario et al. (1984), 47 O.R. (2d) 176 (H.C.J.). 952